



# On the asymptotic behavior and periodic nature of a difference equation with maximum

Ali Gelişken\*, Cengiz Çınar, Abdullah Selçuk Kurbanlı

Mathematics Department, Faculty of Education, Selcuk University, 42090, Konya, Turkey

## ARTICLE INFO

### Article history:

Received 14 March 2009

Received in revised form 25 August 2009

Accepted 7 October 2009

### Keywords:

Max operator

Difference equation

Positive solution

Global attractivity

Periodicity

## ABSTRACT

In this paper, we investigate the asymptotic behavior and periodic nature of positive solutions of the difference equation

$$x_n = \max \left\{ \frac{A}{x_{n-1}}, \frac{1}{x_{n-2}^\alpha} \right\}, \quad n \geq 0,$$

where  $A \geq 0$  and  $0 \leq \alpha \leq 1$ . We prove that every positive solution of this difference equation approaches  $\bar{x} = 1$  or is eventually periodic with a period 2, 3 or 4.

© 2009 Elsevier Ltd. All rights reserved.

## 1. Introduction

The max operator arises naturally in certain models in automatic control theory (see [1,2]). In recent years, the discrete case involving difference equations with maximum has been receiving increasing attention; see e.g., [3–20,1,21,2,22–29] (see also the references therein).

It was proved that every positive solution of the difference equation

$$x_n = \max \left\{ \frac{A}{x_{n-p}^\alpha}, \frac{B}{x_{n-k}^\beta} \right\}, \quad n \geq 0, \quad (1.1)$$

where  $p, k$  are positive integers,  $0 < \alpha < 1$ ,  $0 < \beta < 1$ ,  $0 < A$  and  $0 < B$ , approaches  $\bar{x} = \max \left\{ A^{\frac{1}{\alpha+1}}, B^{\frac{1}{\beta+1}} \right\}$  in [15].

In [25], it was proved that every positive solution of the difference equation

$$x_n = \max \left\{ \frac{A}{x_{n-1}^\alpha}, \frac{B}{x_{n-2}^\beta} \right\}, \quad n \geq 0, \quad (1.2)$$

where  $0 < \alpha < 1$ ,  $0 < \beta < 1$ ,  $0 < A$  and  $0 < B$ , approaches  $\bar{x} = \max \left\{ A^{\frac{1}{\alpha+1}}, B^{\frac{1}{\beta+1}} \right\}$ .

The asymptotic behavior of positive solutions of the difference equation

$$x_n = \max \left\{ \frac{1}{x_{n-1}^\alpha}, \frac{A}{x_{n-2}} \right\}, \quad n \geq 0, \quad (1.3)$$

where  $0 < \alpha < 1$  and  $0 < A$ , was investigated in [29]. It was shown that every positive solution of this difference equation approaches  $\bar{x} = 1$  or is eventually periodic with a period 4. Also, the author of [29] proposed the following conjecture.

\* Corresponding author.

E-mail addresses: [aligelisken@yahoo.com.tr](mailto:aligelisken@yahoo.com.tr) (A. Gelişken), [ccinar@selcuk.edu.tr](mailto:ccinar@selcuk.edu.tr) (C. Çınar), [agurban@selcuk.edu.tr](mailto:agurban@selcuk.edu.tr) (A.S. Kurbanlı).

**Conjecture 1.** Consider the difference equation

$$x_n = \max \left\{ \frac{A_1}{x_{n-1}^{\alpha_1}}, \frac{A_2}{x_{n-2}^{\alpha_2}}, \dots, \frac{A_p}{x_{n-p}^{\alpha_p}} \right\}, \quad n \geq 0, \tag{1.4}$$

where  $A_1 \geq 0, A_2 \geq 0, \dots, A_p \geq 0, 0 \leq \alpha_1 \leq 1, 0 \leq \alpha_2 \leq 1, \dots, 0 \leq \alpha_p \leq 1, \max \{ \alpha_1, \alpha_2, \dots, \alpha_p \} = 1$ . Let  $\alpha_q = 1$ . If  $A_q > \max \{ A_j : 1 \leq j \leq p, j \neq q \}$ , then every positive solution of (1.2) is eventually periodic with a period  $T = 2q$ .

It is interesting that the behavior of their solutions is very different although the difference equation (1.2) and (1.3) are very similar. Motivated by this result, we investigate the asymptotic behavior and periodic nature of positive solutions of the difference equation

$$x_n = \max \left\{ \frac{A}{x_{n-1}}, \frac{1}{x_{n-2}^\alpha} \right\}, \quad n \geq 0, \tag{1.5}$$

where  $0 \leq A, 0 \leq \alpha \leq 1$  and the initial conditions  $x_{-1}, x_{-2}$  are positive real numbers. We prove every positive solution of this difference equation approaches  $\bar{x} = 1$  or is eventually periodic with a period 2, 3 or 4. We believe that the method used in this paper may be used for confirming Conjecture 1.

### 2. Preliminaries

Amleh et al. proved that every positive solution of the difference equation

$$x_{n+1} = \max \left\{ \frac{A}{x_n}, \frac{B}{x_{n-1}} \right\} \tag{2.1}$$

is eventually periodic with a period  $T$ , where  $T = 2$  provided  $A > B \geq 0, T = 4$  provided  $B > A \geq 0$  and  $T = 3$  provided  $A = B > 0$ . So, we conclude that every positive solution of Eq. (1.5) with  $\alpha = 1$  and  $A \geq 0$  is eventually periodic with a period 2, 3 or 4. The proof of this result was given in [3] and will be omitted.

Assume that  $\alpha = 0$  and  $A \geq 0$ . Eq. (1.5) with  $\alpha = 0$  and  $A \geq 0$  has the form

$$x_n = \max \left\{ \frac{A}{x_{n-1}}, 1 \right\}, \quad n \geq 0. \tag{2.2}$$

By iteration, from Eq. (2.2) we get that every positive solution of Eq. (1.5) with  $\alpha = 0$  is eventually periodic with a period 2 in the case  $A > 1$ . In the case  $0 \leq A < 1$ , Eq. (1.5) with  $\alpha = 0$  becomes  $x_n = 1$ , for  $n \geq 1$ .

Assume that  $A = 0$  and  $0 < \alpha < 1$ . Then, from Eq. (1.5) we obtain immediately

$$x_n = \frac{1}{x_{n-2}^\alpha} \quad \text{for } n \geq 0. \tag{2.3}$$

It has been proved that every solution to the difference equation  $x_n = \frac{A}{x_{n-m}^\alpha}, 0 < \alpha < 1, A > 0$  converges to  $\bar{x} = A^{\frac{1}{\alpha+1}}$  in [25]. So, every positive solution of the Eq. (2.3) approaches  $\bar{x} = 1$  and its proof will be omitted.

### 3. The case $A = 1$

We consider the difference equation

$$x_n = \max \left\{ \frac{1}{x_{n-1}}, \frac{1}{x_{n-2}^\alpha} \right\}, \quad n \geq 0, \tag{3.1}$$

where  $0 < \alpha < 1$ .

**Theorem 1.** If  $x_n$  is a positive solution of Eq. (3.1), then  $x_n$  approaches  $\bar{x} = 1$ .

**Proof.** Choose a number  $B$  such that  $0 < B < 1$ , let  $x_n = B^{y_n}$  for  $n \geq -2$ . Then, Eq. (3.1) implies the difference equation

$$y_n = \min \{ -y_{n-1}, -\alpha y_{n-2} \}, \quad n \geq 0, \tag{3.2}$$

where  $0 < \alpha < 1$  and initial conditions are real numbers.

Let  $y_n$  be a solution of Eq. (3.2). Then it suffices to prove  $y_n \rightarrow 0$ . Observe that there exists a positive integer  $N$  such that  $y_{3n+N} \geq 0$  for  $n \geq 0$ . By direct computation, we get that,  $y_{3n+N-1} \leq 0, y_{3n+N-2} \leq 0, y_{3n+N+1} = -y_{3n+N}, y_{3n+N+2} = -\alpha y_{3n+N}, y_{3n+N+3} = \alpha y_{3n+N}$  and  $y_{3n+N+1} \leq y_{3n+N+2} \leq 0 \leq y_{3n+N+3} \leq y_{3n+N}$ . So,  $y_{3n+N+1} \rightarrow 0, y_{3n+N+2} \rightarrow 0$  and  $y_{3n+N} \rightarrow 0$ . This implies  $y_n \rightarrow 0$ .  $\square$

**4. The case  $0 < A < 1$**

We consider Eq. (1.5), where  $0 < \alpha < 1$ . Using the substitution  $x_n = A^{y_n}$ ,  $n \geq -2$ , we get the difference equation

$$y_n = \min \{1 - y_{n-1}, -\alpha y_{n-2}\}, \quad n \geq 0, \tag{4.1}$$

where the initial conditions  $y_{-1}, y_{-2}$  are real numbers.

We need the following lemma to prove the main result.

**Lemma 1.** *Let  $y_n$  be a solution of Eq. (4.1). Then,*

$$|y_n| \leq \max \{|y_{n-1}| - 1, \alpha |y_{n-2}|\} \tag{4.2}$$

for all  $n \geq 0$ .

**Proof.** From Eq. (4.1), we have the following:

If  $y_{n-1} \geq 0$  and  $y_{n-2} \geq 0$  for some  $n$ , then  $|y_n| \leq \max \{|y_{n-1}| - 1, \alpha |y_{n-2}|\}$ .

If  $y_{n-1} \leq 0$  and  $y_{n-2} \leq 0$  for some  $n$ , then  $|y_n| \leq \alpha |y_{n-2}|$ .

If  $y_{n-1} \geq 0$  and  $y_{n-2} \leq 0$  for some  $n$ , then  $|y_n| \leq \max \{|y_{n-1}| - 1, \alpha |y_{n-2}|\}$ .

If  $y_{n-1} \leq 0$  and  $y_{n-2} \geq 0$  for some  $n$ , then  $|y_n| = \alpha |y_{n-2}|$ .

In general, we have

$$|y_n| \leq \max \{|y_{n-1}| - 1, \alpha |y_{n-2}|\}$$

for  $n \geq 0$ .  $\square$

**Theorem 2.** *If  $x_n$  is a positive solution of Eq. (1.5), where  $0 < A < 1$  and  $0 < \alpha < 1$ , then  $x_n$  approaches  $\bar{x} = 1$ .*

**Proof.** Let  $y_n$  is a solution of Eq. (4.1). To prove  $x_n$  approaches one, it suffices to show that  $y_n$  approaches zero. From Lemma 1, we have

$$|y_n| \leq \max \{|y_{n-1}| - 1, \alpha |y_{n-2}|\}$$

for all  $n \geq 0$ . We can choose a number  $\beta$  such that  $|y_{n-1}| - 1 \leq \beta |y_{n-1}|$  and  $0 < \beta < 1$ . Then from (4.2), we get that

$$|y_n| \leq \max \{\beta |y_{n-1}|, \alpha |y_{n-2}|\}, \quad n \geq 0. \tag{4.3}$$

Let  $\gamma = \max \{\beta, \alpha\}$ , then we get that

$$|y_n| \leq \gamma \max \{|y_{n-1}|, |y_{n-2}|\}, \tag{4.4}$$

where  $0 < \gamma < 1$ , for all  $n \geq 0$ .

From (4.4) and by iteration, we get that

$$|y_0| \leq \gamma \max \{|y_{-1}|, |y_{-2}|\},$$

$$|y_1| \leq \gamma \max \{|y_{-1}|, |y_{-2}|\},$$

$$|y_2| \leq \gamma \max \{\gamma |y_{-1}|, \gamma |y_{-2}|\}$$

$$\leq \gamma^2 \max \{|y_{-1}|, |y_{-2}|\},$$

$$|y_3| \leq \gamma^2 \max \{|y_{-1}|, |y_{-2}|\}$$

and in the end the generalisation

$$|y_n| \leq \gamma^{\lfloor \frac{n+2}{2} \rfloor} \max \{|y_{-1}|, |y_{-2}|\} \tag{4.5}$$

for all  $n \geq 0$ . From (4.5), we get immediately that  $y_n$  approaches zero as  $n \rightarrow \infty$ .  $\square$

**5. The case  $A > 1$**

**Theorem 3.** *Every positive solution of Eq. (1.5), where  $0 < \alpha < 1$  and  $A > 1$ , is eventually periodic with a period 2.*

**Proof.** Assume that  $x_n$  is a solution of Eq. (1.5), where  $A > 1$  and  $0 < \alpha < 1$ . Let  $x_n = A^{y_n}$  for  $n \geq -2$ . Then, Eq. (1.5) implies the difference equation

$$y_n = \max \{1 - y_{n-1}, -\alpha y_{n-2}\}, \quad n \geq 0, \tag{5.1}$$

where the initial conditions are real numbers. Let  $y_n$  be a solution of Eq. (5.1). It suffices to show that  $y_n$  is eventually periodic with a period 2, to prove that  $x_n$  is eventually periodic with a period 2.

We shall show that there is an integer  $N$  such that  $y_n \geq 0$  for all  $n \geq N$ . On the contrary, we assume that there is a positive integer  $k$  such that,  $y_{n+k} < 0$  for all  $n \geq N$ . So, we have  $y_{n+k-1} > 0$  and  $y_{n+k-2} > 0$  from Eq. (5.1). Then, by computation we get  $y_{n+k+1} > 0$ ,  $y_{n+k+2} > 0$  and  $y_{n+k+3} = 1 + \alpha y_{n+k}$ .

If  $y_{n+k+3} \geq 0$ , then by computation we get  $y_{n+k+4} > 0$ ,  $y_{n+k+5} \geq 0$  and  $y_{n+k+6} = -\alpha y_{n+k} > 0$ . So, we obtain immediately  $y_n \geq 0$  for  $n \geq N + k + 1$ .

If  $y_{n+k+3} < 0$ , we have  $-y_{n+k} > \frac{1}{\alpha}$ . Then by computation, we get that

$$y_{n+k+4} > 0, \quad y_{n+k+5} > 0 \quad \text{and} \quad y_{n+k+6} = \left( \sum_{m=0}^1 \alpha^m \right) + \alpha^2 y_{n+k}.$$

If  $y_{n+k+6} \geq 0$ , we obtain immediately  $y_n \geq 0$  for all  $n \geq N + k + 4$  by similarity.

If  $y_{n+k+6} < 0$ , we get that

$$-y_{n+k} > \sum_{m=1}^2 \frac{1}{\alpha^m}, \quad y_{n+k+7} > 0 \quad \text{and} \quad y_{n+k+8} > 0.$$

By similarity,  $y_{n+k+9}$  is either negative or not negative. But, it is a reality  $\left( \sum_{m=1}^l \frac{1}{\alpha^m} \right) \rightarrow \infty$  as  $l \rightarrow \infty$ . So, there is a positive integer  $l$  ( $l > k$ ) such that

$$-y_{n+k} \leq \sum_{m=1}^{\frac{l-k}{3}} \frac{1}{\alpha^m} \quad \text{and} \quad y_{n+l-3} < 0.$$

Then, we obtain  $y_{n+l-2} = 1 - y_{n+l-3}$ ,  $y_{n+l-1} = -\alpha y_{n+l-3}$  and  $y_{n+l} = 1 + \alpha y_{n+l-3} \geq 0$ . By computation, we get immediately  $y_{n+l+1} > 0$ ,  $y_{n+l+2} \geq 0$  and  $y_{n+l+3} = -\alpha y_{n+l-3}$ . We obtain  $y_n \geq 0$  for  $n \geq N + l - 2$ . Clearly, there is an integer  $N$  such that  $y_n \geq 0$  for  $n \geq N$ .

Consider  $y_n \geq 0$  for  $n \geq N$ . Then, from Eq. (5.1) we get that

$$y_{N+2} = \max \{1 - y_{N+1}, -\alpha y_N\} \geq 0.$$

If  $y_{N+2} = 1 - y_{N+1}$ , we get that  $y_{N+3} = 1 - y_{N+2}$ . So, we have  $y_n = 1 - y_{n-1}$  for all  $n \geq N + 2$ .

If  $y_{N+2} = -\alpha y_N$ , then we get  $y_N = 0$ ,  $y_{N+1} > 1$  and  $y_{N+3} = 1 - y_{N+2}$ . Then, we have  $y_n = 1 - y_{n-1}$  for all  $n \geq N + 3$ . Clearly, there is an integer  $N$  such that  $y_n = 1 - y_{n-1}$  for  $n \geq N$ . So,  $y_n$  is eventually periodic with a period 2. This is desired.  $\square$

## References

- [1] A.D. Mishkis, On some problems of the theory of differential equations with deviating argument, *Uspekhi Mat. Nauk* 32 (2) (1977) 173–202. 194.
- [2] E.P. Popov, *Automatic regulation and control*, Nauka, Moscow, Russia, 1966 (in Russian).
- [3] R.M. Abu-Saris, F.M. Allan, Periodic and nonperiodic solutions of the difference equation  $x_{n+1} = \max \{x_n^2, A\} / x_n x_{n-1}$ , in: *Advances in Difference Equations* (Veszprém, 1985), Gordon and Breach, Amsterdam The Netherlands, 1997, pp. 9–17.
- [4] R. Abu-Saris, F. Allan, Rational recursive sequences involving the maximum function, *Far East J. Math.* 1 (3) (1999) 335–342.
- [5] A.M. Amleh, J. Hoag, G. Ladas, A difference equation with eventually periodic solutions, *Comput. Math. Appl.* 36 (1998) 401–404.
- [6] K. Berenhaut, J. Foley, S. Stević, Boundedness character of positive solutions of a max difference equation, *J. Difference Equ. Appl.* 12 (12) (2006) 1193–1199.
- [7] W.J. Briden, E.A. Grove, C.M. Kent, G. Ladas, Eventually periodic solutions of  $x_{n+1} = \max \{1/x_n, A_n/x_{n-1}\}$ , *Commun. Appl. Nonlinear Anal.* 6 (1999) 31–34.
- [8] W.J. Briden, E.A. Grove, G. Ladas, L.C. McGrath, On the nonautonomous equation  $x_{n+1} = \max \{A_n/x_n, B_n/x_{n-1}\}$ , in: *Proceedings of the Third International Conference on Difference Equation and Applications*, Sept. 1–5, Taipei, Taiwan, 1997, Gordon and Breach Science Publishers, London, 1999, pp. 49–73.
- [9] C. Çinar, S. Stević, I. Yalçınkaya, On positive solutions of a reciprocal difference equation with minimum, *J. Appl. Math. Comput.* 17 (1-2) (2005) 307–314.
- [10] E.M. Elsayed, S. Stević, On the max type equation,  $x_{n+1} = \max \{A/x_n, x_{n-2}\}$ , *Nonlinear Anal. TMA* 71 (3-4) (2009) 910–922.
- [11] J. Feuer, On the eventual periodicity of  $x_{n+1} = \max \{1/x_n, A_n/x_{n-1}\}$  with a period-four parameter, *J. Difference Equ. Appl.* 12 (5) (2006) 467–486.
- [12] A. Gelişken, C. Çinar, R. Karataş, A note on periodicity of the Lyness max equation, *Adv. Differ. Equ.* 2008 (2008) Article ID 651747 5 pages.
- [13] A. Gelişken, C. Çinar, I. Yalçınkaya, On the periodicity of a difference equation with maximum, *Discrete Dyn. Nat. Soc.* 2008 (2008) Article ID 820629 11 pages.
- [14] A. Gelişken, C. Çinar, On the global attractivity of a max-type difference equation, *Discrete Dyn. Nat. Soc.* (2009) Article ID 812674 5 pages.
- [15] A. Gelişken, C. Çinar, A note on a max-type difference equation, *Indag. Math.* (2009) (submitted for publication).
- [16] E.A. Grove, G. Ladas, *Periodicities in Nonlinear Difference Equations*, CRC Press, Chapman & Hall, 2005.
- [17] E.A. Grove, C.M. Kent, G. Ladas, M.A. Radin, On  $x_{n+1} = \max \{1/x_n, A_n/x_{n-1}\}$  with a period 3 parameter, *Fields Inst. Commun.* 29 (2001).
- [18] C.M. Kent, M.A. Radin, On the boundedness nature of positive solutions of the difference equation  $x_{n+1} = \max \{A_n/x_n, B_n/x_{n-1}\}$  with periodic parameters, *Dyn. Contin. Discrete Impuls. Syst. Appl. Algorithms suppl.* (2003) 11–15.
- [19] G. Ladas, On the recursive sequence  $x_n = \max \left\{ \frac{A_1}{x_{n-1}}, \frac{A_2}{x_{n-2}}, \dots, \frac{A_p}{x_{n-p}} \right\}$ , open problems and conjectures, *J. Difference Equ. Appl.* 2 (1996) 339–341.
- [20] D.P. Mishev, W.T. Patula, H.D. Voulou, A reciprocal difference equation with maximum, *Comput. Math. Appl.* 43 (2002) 1021–1026.
- [21] W.T. Patula, H.D. Voulou, On a max type recurrence relation with periodic coefficients, *J. Difference Equ. Appl.* 10 (3) (2004) 329–338.
- [22] S. Stević, On the recursive sequence  $x_{n+1} = a + \frac{x_n^p}{x_{n-1}}$ , *Discrete Dyn. Nat. Soc.* 2007 (2007) 9 pages.
- [23] S. Stević, Global stability of a difference equation with maximum, *Appl. Math. Comput.* 210 (2) (2009) 524–529.

- [24] S. Stević, On the recursive sequence  $x_{n+1} = \max \left\{ c, \frac{x_n^p}{x_{n-1}^p} \right\}$ , Appl. Math. Lett. 21 (8) (2008) 791–796.
- [25] F. Sun, On the asymptotic behavior of a difference equation with maximum, Discrete Dyn. Nat. Soc. 2008 (2008) doi:10.1155/2008. Artical ID 243291, 6 pages.
- [26] I. Szalkai, On the on the periodicity of the sequence  $x_{n+1} = \max \left\{ \frac{A_0}{x_n}, \frac{A_1}{x_{n-1}}, \dots, \frac{A_k}{x_{n-k}} \right\}$ , J. Difference Equ. Appl. 5 (1999) 25–29.
- [27] H.D. Voulov, On the periodic character of some difference equations, J. Difference Equ. Appl. 8 (9) (2002) 799–810.
- [28] I. Yalçinkaya, B.D. Iričanin, C. Çinar, On a max-type difference equation, Discrete Dyn. Nat. Soc. 2007 (2007) Artical ID 47264 11 pages.
- [29] X. Yang, X. Liao, C. Li, On a difference equation with maximum, Appl. Math. Comput. 181 (2006) 1–5.